

**CITY OF MANHATTAN BEACH
PARKING AND PUBLIC IMPROVEMENTS COMMISSION
MINUTES OF REGULAR MEETING
JUNE 26, 2008**

A. CALL TO ORDER

The regular meeting of the Parking and Public Improvements Commission of the City of Manhattan Beach, California, was held on the 26th day of June, 1008, at the hour of 6:35 p.m., in the City Council Chambers of City Hall, at 1400 Highland Avenue, in said City.

B. ROLL CALL

Present: Adami, Gross, Silverman, Stabile and Chair Donahue.
Absent: None.
Staff Present: Zandvliet, Stevenson.
Clerk: Weeks.

C. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – May 22, 2008

A motion was MADE and SECONDED (Gross/Stabile) to approve the minutes of May 22, 2008.

AYES: Adami, Gross, Silverman and Chair Donahue.
NOES: None.
ABSENT: Silverman (arrived at 6:40 p.m.)
ABSTAIN: None.

D. AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION

None.

E. GENERAL BUSINESS

1. Aviation at 12th and 19th Street: Left-Turn Traffic Evaluation

Management Analyst Stevenson introduced this item.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet presented the staff report and recommendation to install a new traffic signal at the intersection of Aviation Boulevard and 19th Street and prohibit eastbound and northbound left turn movements at Aviation Boulevard and 12th Street. He noted that correspondence and petitions requesting prohibition of northbound left turns at Aviation Boulevard and 19th Street due to an increase in collisions were received after a third southbound lane was installed on Aviation

Boulevard and that various measures to improve the situation could divert traffic to other residential streets in the area. He outlined the following potential traffic safety measures: install peak hour turn restrictions; prohibit turn movements; remove the third southbound lane on Aviation Boulevard; improve visibility by moving existing block walls along the west side of Aviation Boulevard; install stop signs in all directions; designate 12th or 19th Streets as one-way between Wendy Way and Aviation Boulevard in the westbound direction; and install a traffic signal at Aviation Boulevard and 19th Street, at a cost of approximately \$300,000.

In answer to questions from the Commission, Traffic Engineer Zandvliet provided input regarding the increased number of traffic collisions at Aviation Boulevard and 12th and 19th Streets from July 2007 through December 2007. He advised that the recommended traffic signal would be an on-demand type that would remain clear on Aviation Boulevard when no cars are waiting and that sealing off a street is a General Plan element, which the Commission could discuss and recommend to the City Council.

Commissioner Gross stated his support for considering the idea of closing off 19th Street, particularly since it appears that much of the traffic is caused by drivers who do not live in Liberty Village and are cutting through. He pointed out that energy is now an important consideration, but an additional traffic signal would reduce traffic speeds.

Commissioner Stabile voiced concern that there are currently three traffic signals within approximately one-half mile of this location, and another is now proposed.

Commissioner Adami entertained the idea of closing off one-half of 19th Street to restrict two-way traffic from accessing Aviation Boulevard.

Chair Donahue related his understanding that closing off streets should not be a consideration of the Commission at this time.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet explained that the timing of the traffic signals in the area would be coordinated; that it is possible to have more than four traffic signals in a one-half mile radius without interruption; that, while energy is a consideration, traffic safety is of paramount importance; and that closing off 19th Street would result in approximately 1,000 vehicles being diverted to other streets.

Audience Participation

Cliff Davis, 1609 Wendy Way, recalled that closing off 19th Street was previously considered, but it would impede emergency vehicle access. It was his opinion that the third lane on Aviation Boulevard should be eliminated; that installing a traffic signal on Aviation Boulevard at 12th Street should be considered; that exiting Liberty Village would be very difficult if 19th Street is closed; and that installing hash marks should be examined.

Richard Wong, 1809 Wendy Way, explained that the traffic problems in the area began after the third lane on Aviation Boulevard was installed and that traffic speeds in the third lane are significant, especially when traffic on Aviation Boulevard is backed up; that a traffic signal at 19th Street and Aviation Boulevard would be very effective, but expensive and that he could agree with the idea of blocking off 19th Street.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet clarified for Mr. Wong that most of the traffic collisions at 19th Street and Aviation Boulevard involved local residents; however, most of those at 12th Street involved drivers from out of town.

Jim Box, 1201 Faymont Avenue, commented that access to the freeway has become more difficult since the third lane on Aviation Boulevard was installed; that flashing lights, or an alternative thereto, could be installed on Aviation Boulevard to help reduce traffic speeds; that closing off 19th Street would divert traffic to other streets; and that a traffic signal at 19th Street and Aviation Boulevard would be moderately inconvenient, but preferable over the current situation.

Bill Bridwell, 1909 Manzanita Lane, discussed traffic safety problems in the area. He felt that 19th Street could be closed and that installing a traffic signal at 19th Street and Aviation Boulevard would be a good first step, but it would not stop the speeding problems and could result in increased traffic on 19th Street.

Diane Rich, 1904 Wendy Way, said that left turns onto 12th Street should be restricted; that the installation of a traffic signal would be better than nothing, but she would prefer closing 19th Street; that many accidents occurring during non-peak hours are not reported; that many of the problems are caused by drivers cutting through Liberty Village; that the dip at 19th Street and Wendy Way is very dangerous; and that the third lane on Aviation Boulevard made problems worse, but it should not be eliminated.

Commissioner Stabile voiced his understanding that it is not within the Commission's purview to address the number of lanes on Aviation Boulevard.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet clarified that part of staff's recommendation is to prohibit northbound and eastbound left turn movements at Aviation Boulevard and 12th Street. He advised that a portion of Aviation Boulevard in question is in both Manhattan Beach and Redondo Beach and that the Commission is an advisory body that makes recommendations to the Council.

Fred Crawford, 1704 Wendy Way, contended that a traffic signal at 19th Street and Aviation would be the best solution. He disagreed with closing either 12th or 19th Streets.

Seema Grover-Wong, 1809 Wendy Way, shared information about the unsafe conditions in the area, particularly for pedestrians and children. She requested that an

interim measure to improve safety be implemented until a final decision can be made; noted that accidents have increased since the third lane was installed on Aviation Boulevard; voiced her concern that traffic from 12th Street would be diverted onto 19th Street should a traffic signal at 19th Street and Aviation Boulevard be installed; and supported closing off 19th Street.

Virginia Arenas, 1205 Faymont Avenue, discussed the unsafe conditions in the area; the poor visibility resulting from the existing block walls along the west side of Aviation Boulevard; the need for additional enforcement in the area; the adverse affect of the traffic on property values; and the problems caused by the previous removal of right-turn restrictions from Aviation Boulevard onto Marine Avenue. Ms. Arenas stated her disagreement with installing a traffic signal at 19th Street and Aviation Boulevard.

Bill Rich, 1904 Wendy Way, maintained that a traffic signal at 19th Street and Aviation Boulevard would be an unnecessary expense and that the elimination of left turns from Aviation Boulevard onto 12th and 19th Street would solve the great majority of the problems.

Kathy Austin, 1612 Wendy Way, favored installing left-turn restrictions at peak hours and evaluating the number of traffic collisions thereafter. It was her feeling that whatever is done at 19th Street should also be done at 12th Street.

Jeffrey Yakubik, 1612 Wendy Way, objected to the third lane on Aviation Boulevard and to closing 19th Street. He supported installing left-turn restrictions during peak hours and evaluating the effect of increased signage prior to installing a traffic signal. Mr. Yakubik agreed that whatever is done at 19th Street should be done at 12th Street.

Barbara Heacox, 1808 Harkness Street, felt that it is important to have a traffic signal at 19th Street and Aviation Boulevard during specified times and that 19th Street should not be closed.

Wilma Robinson, 1813 Lindgrove, commented that 19th Street should not be closed; that, contrary to a previous traffic study; most of the traffic in the area is caused by drivers who do not live in Manhattan Beach; that the third lane on Aviation Boulevard has resulted in problems and eliminating it would be helpful; and that she is neutral about installing a traffic signal at 19th Street and Aviation Boulevard.

Judy Kerner, Wendy Way, discussed her frustration due to the poor visibility from the block walls along the west side of Aviation Boulevard. She stated her agreement with installing a traffic signal at 19th Street and Aviation Boulevard and her objection to closing 19th Street.

Chair Donahue closed the public hearing at 7:47 p.m.

Commission discussion began with Commissioner Stabile pointing out that traffic safety must be an overriding concern and that it is not within the Commission's purview to eliminate the third lane on Aviation Boulevard or regulate the speed limit on Aviation Boulevard. He explained that he could not support a traffic signal on 19th Street at Aviation Boulevard because it would be overkill, would result in 19th Street becoming more of a thoroughfare and would inconvenience residents. Commissioner Stabile said that the traffic collisions appear to take place throughout the day, so restricting turns at specific times would not be adequate. He suggested that the ideas of creating right-turn pockets on Aviation Boulevard at 19th Street and improving sight lines at Aviation Boulevard and 12th Street be examined; that left turns from northbound Aviation Boulevard to eastbound 12th and 19th Streets be prohibited; and that left turns from 12th and 19th Streets onto Aviation Boulevard be prohibited.

Commissioner Adami agreed that safety should be an overriding concern. However, he felt that left-turn movements from northbound Aviation Boulevard to eastbound 12th and 19th Streets should be prohibited at specific times, and implemented on a trial basis.

Commissioner Gross related his opinion that left-turn movements from northbound Aviation Boulevard to eastbound 12th and 19th Streets and left turns from 12th Street and 19th Street onto Aviation Boulevard should be prohibited all of the time.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet explained that restricting traffic movements could result in additional traffic on other streets and that left-turn restrictions could be implemented quickly.

Chair Donahue agreed that left turns from northbound Aviation Boulevard to eastbound 12th and 19th Streets should be prohibited all of the time. He discussed that left-turn restrictions out of 12th or 19th Streets onto Aviation Boulevard would greatly reduce traffic collisions and traffic on Wendy Way and that the idea of installing a right-turn pocket on Aviation Boulevard at 19th Street could be examined.

Commissioner Silverman suggested that this topic be re-visited after measures to improve the situation have been taken.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet verified that traffic counts could be taken before and after measures to improve the situation have been taken.

A motion was MADE and SECONDED (Stabile/Gross) to:

- Prohibit left turns from northbound Aviation Boulevard to eastbound 12th and 19th Streets;
- Prohibit left turns from 12th and 19th Streets onto Aviation Boulevard;
- Create right-turn pockets on Aviation Boulevard at 19th Street;
- Revisit this situation in six months; and
- Examine ways to improve sight lines at 12th Street.

AYES: Adami, Gross, Silverman, Stabile and Chair Gross.
NOES: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

Management Analyst Stevenson advised that the Commission's recommendation will be considered by the City Council on July 22, 2008, 6:30 p.m.

*

At 8:05 p.m., there was a recess until 8:20 p.m., when the meeting reconvened in regular agenda order with all Commissioners present.

*

2. **Downtown Parking Management Plan – Continue Public Hearing**

This item was introduced by Management Analyst Stevenson.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet explained that this item was continued from the Parking and Public Improvements Commission meeting on May 22, 2008 and that the Commission's discussion of the item this evening was re-noticed. He outlined the Downtown Parking Management Plan Strategies recommended by the City Council and clarified that the middle level of Lot 3 is not under utilized; that various areas in the City are designated as unmetered zones by the Coastal Commission and the Coastal Commission's approval would be necessary for areas in the Coastal Zone; that the idea of installing parking meters in unmetered areas adjacent to commercial establishments is being examined; and that staff would not be in favor of installing meters in the upper level of the Civic Center lot because of the government-type uses it serves. Traffic Engineer Zandvliet noted written material provided by Mr. Don McPherson distributed during the meeting and he thanked Commissioner Gross for his additional thoughts, which helped stimulate discussion this evening.

Management Analyst Stevenson advised that the Coastal Commission has jurisdiction over all aspects of public parking close to the beach and that Lot 8 used to be metered, but the Coastal Commission required the removal of the meters. She mentioned that a requirement to park within 1,000 feet of a business is attached to some Conditional Use Permits.

Chair Donahue related his impression that many drivers will park in unmetered residential areas rather than pay for parking.

Commissioner Stabile discussed that the upper level of the Civic Center Lot could be metered after 6:00 p.m. He voiced his understanding that the Commission's

recommendations will be considered by the City Council and anticipated that raising parking meter rates/installing more meters adjacent to commercial properties would be approved by the Coastal Commission.

Commissioner Gross related his viewpoint that the elimination of merchant parking spaces in Lots 1 and 2 should be discussed under Strategy No. 9 (Provide monthly merchant permits and stickers for employees who may not be able to afford biannual permits).

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet advised that one alternative to Strategy No. 10 (Decrease merchant permit costs in Metlox structure to make parking lots more attractive than free residential street spaces) would be to raise the six-month permit parking rate and implement an employer incentive program to lower rates for employees and that the idea of Strategy No. 11 (Allow residents to override time limit parking restrictions in residential zones within the Downtown area) is to provide hang tags tied to vehicles and temporary visitor permits tied to residents' addresses.

Chairman Donahue opened the public hearing.

Michael Zislis, President of the Downtown Business and Professional Association and owner of various businesses in Manhattan Beach, related his concern that various ideas provided by staff are not as the DBPA understood them to be, and that they differ from the Strategies recommended by the Council as well. He discussed that lots under utilized at the current parking rate will be very much under utilized at an increased rate; that ATM style cash keys are a good idea and could be sold at various Downtown establishments; that employee parking in the lower level of the Metlox structure could be offered at \$10.00 per month; that high impact uses should pay parking taxes; that, if the system were equitable, he could support merchants paying for employee parking permits; that problems on Valley could be resolved with three-hour parking; that Strategy No. 15 (Implement a parking directional sign plan with a distinctive and clear identity) is necessary and should be installed immediately. Mr. Zislis felt that this matter has been extensively discussed and that action should be taken as soon as possible.

Commissioner Gross related his feeling that parking in under utilized lots would have to be free in order for employees to park there and that there are many small parking spaces Downtown in which micro cars could fit. With regard to concerns expressed by the Downtown Business and Professional Association, he clarified that the information presented by staff was compiled prior to receiving input from the public and the Commission.

Ron Koch, Chairman of the Business Improvement District (BID) in the Downtown area, echoed Mr. Zislis' comments. He suggested that consideration be given to how doubling the parking meter rates in the Downtown area will affect the customer base; that there appears to be a disconnect between the people who are administering the parking plan and the users; that employers should be required to

provide parking spaces/fees for their employees in under utilized lots; that this item needs to be further addressed and the Commission should not make recommendations to the Council this evening; and that care must be taken not to make too many changes at once.

David Arias, 1219 Morningside Drive, provided input regarding his examination of the existing parking situation and recommendations for the Downtown area, including the excessive revenues that would be generated from the proposed parking rate increases. It was his opinion that behavior could be changed through an employer parking program requiring employees to park in the least desirable areas; that parking rate increases will not deter drivers from parking where it is convenient; that it is not necessary to extend the metered parking hours to 7:00 or 8:00 a.m.; that parking rates for part-time employees should be less, but not free; that more revenue will be generated by issuing more permits at lower rates; and that the proposed parking plan will tax business owners in the Downtown area and could discourage customers from shopping there.

Commissioner Gross explained that the main purpose of this effort is to change behavior, not generate revenues, and that any extra revenue generated could be used to subsidize an employer parking program.

Noting that her comments are centered around one block on 11th Street, **Edna Murphy, 625 11th Street**, related her agreement with the majority of the proposed Strategies, including increased parking meter rates to encourage short visits to the Downtown area, but not an extension of metered parking to 7:00 a.m. She asked that the idea of crafting parking permit programs for specific areas be considered and that the Commission examine Hermosa Beach's resident permit parking plan and problems resulting from employees of Advanced Painting parking on 11th Street.

Mary Ann Barney, Executive Director of the Downtown Business and Professional Association, shared information on her efforts to inform Downtown business owners of the importance of educating employees about parking. She indicated that some of the proposed Strategies are different than those to which the DBPA agreed; that pass keys need to be made available to patrons, and she would be willing to assist in this process; that the biggest issue appears to be encouraging employees to park in the lower Metlox Lot; that monthly parking permits should be issued for part-time employees; and that a parking fee of \$2.00 per hour seems excessive.

Commissioner Silverman commented on the importance of considering every group during the decision-making process. He noted the objective to alleviate stress of parking Downtown.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet explained that a resident parking permit program for a portion of the City could be approved and that approximately one-half or more of the

Downtown business owners have indicated they would not pay for employee parking permits on a voluntary basis.

Referring to written material he provided during the meeting, **Don Macpherson, 1014 1st Street and owning residential property at 10th and Bayview**, stressed the importance of coordinating with the Coastal Commission far in advance of presenting a Downtown parking plan to them. He entertained the idea of freeing up parking spaces for the public to use in Lots 1 and 2 and moving merchant parking elsewhere.

Jackie May, 10th Street and Highland, observed that discussion of parking problems has addressed businesses and residents, but not beachgoers. Ms. May explained that she does not have problems parking in her neighborhood, but parking there is difficult for visitors, and that she could support residential parking permit requirements with temporary visitor permits.

Chair Donahue closed the public hearing at 10:00 p.m.

*

At 10:00 p.m., there was a recess until 10:15 p.m., when discussion of the Downtown Parking Management Plan continued with all Commissioners present.

*

The Commissioners generally agreed that, given the late hour, it would be a good idea to express their thoughts and continue the item.

Management Analyst Stevenson clarified the three big issues at hand: raising parking meter rates; implementing a residential parking permit program; and implementing a merchant parking program whereby employers pay employee parking.

Commissioner Adami observed that implementing a directional sign plan for parking would be a quick fix.

A MOTION was MADE and SECONDED (Gross/Adami) to form a subcommittee consisting of two Parking and Public Improvements Commissioners to examine the idea of installing directional parking signage Downtown, with the understanding that immediate temporary signs that fit within the directional sign program are a priority.

AYES: Adami, Silverman, Stabile, Gross and Chair Donahue.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: None.

A MOTION was MADE and SECONDED (Silverman/Stabile) to nominate Commissioners Gross and Adami to serve on the Parking and Public Improvements Commission subcommittee to examine the idea of installing directional parking signage

Downtown, with the understanding that immediate temporary signs that fit within the directional sign program are a priority.

AYES: Adami, Silverman, Stabile, Gross and Chair Donahue.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: None.

Mentioning that this is his first meeting as a Parking and Public Improvements Commissioner, Commissioner Adami said that he would like more information prior to making any determinations. However, he stated his disagreement with parking meters in residential areas and that requiring parking meters after 10:00 p.m. would create problems. He noted a residential parking permit program in another city that includes the capability of obtaining visitor permits over the internet, as well as machines in another city that accept credit cards for payment of parking.

Commissioner Stabile voiced his understanding that removing employer/employee parking from the streets and into parking lots/redistributing parking into under utilized lots are of high priority and he indicated the following: that he would like to see a system where employers are required to either provide on-site parking for employees or pay for employee parking permits that would be valid only in the lower Metlox Lot, upper Lot 3 and lower Civic Center Lot, with the permits being tied into the business license renewals; that employer/employee parking should be eliminated in Lots 1 and 2 to free up spaces for beach and customer parking in the southwest quadrant, where there appears to be a shortage; that he could not support metered parking in residential areas or a residential override program (complicated and difficult to enforce), but could support a residential parking permit system for residents only, that is as close to free as it can be and includes a mechanism to obtain visitor parking permits over the internet; that he could support the proposed recommendations for parking meter rates and meters in commercial areas; and that meters on the upper level of the Civic Center Lot should be from 6:00 p.m. forward so parking there during business and Library hours would be free.

Commissioner Silverman stated his opposition to extending parking meter hours to 7:00 a.m.; his concern that the Downtown Business and Professional Association had a different impression than the recommendations before the Commission this evening; his agreement with proposed Strategy Nos. 3 (Increase the number of 24-minute street parking adjacent to certain businesses with short-term parking needs), 4 (Increase time limits in the upper level of Metlox structure to 3 hours), 5 (Increase time limits lower level of Metlox structure to 10 hours and on the upper level of Lot 3) and 6 (Pursue installation of ATM style cash key recharge stations in public lots), but not for a profit. He commented that he would like additional information prior to requiring parking meters after 10:00 p.m.; that \$2.00 per hour for parking seems excessive; that the concentration should be on removing employer/employee parking from the streets; that an employer parking program for employees could be subsidized and he would prefer

providing incentives rather than requiring such a program; and that he could agree with a residential parking permit system as a pilot program with a review in the future.

Commissioner Gross expressed his concern over being able to adequately sell the program to the Council and the Coastal Commission. He indicated his agreement with many of Commissioner Stabile's ideas and pointed out that their success would depend on how they are implemented. Commissioner Gross pointed out that parking payment machines were previously utilized at the lower beach lot, but they failed, and that a subcommittee could be formed to help avoid any more surprises such as those mentioned this evening by various speakers from the Downtown Business and Professional Association, to examine possible locations for free employee parking, which could be subsidized by businesses and, possibly, the City, with different parameters for small and large businesses, and to examine means of distributing cash keys in the near future on a temporary basis. It was his opinion that a \$2.00 per hour parking rate is a good idea because there should be a big enough differential between where drivers want to park and where the City wants them to park, but this has been poorly communicated; that directional parking signs are very important in changing behavior; that he could agree with implementing 24 minute street parking adjacent to businesses with short-term parking needs and increasing time limits in the upper level of the Metlox Lot to three hours; that parking meters should accept tokens or dollar coins, instead of other coins; that it is very important to remove employer/employee parking from Lots 1 and 2; and that enforcement is a very important issue that must be addressed.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet clarified that a \$2.00 per hour parking rate has been a recommended policy from the beginning of the discussions about Downtown parking.

F. COMMISSION ITEMS

Parking Meter Revenues and Traffic Violations Revenues Report

Provided in agenda packets.

G. STAFF ITEMS

None.

H. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 10:50 p.m.